

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

CARLOS WILLIAMS,

Plaintiff,

v.

LORI LAWSON, et al.,

Defendants.

CASE NO. C21-5536 MJP

ORDER DENYING MOTION TO
COMPEL KIOSK MESSAGES

This matter comes before the Court on Plaintiff Carlos Williams’ Motion to Compel Redacted Kiosk Messages. (Dkt. No. 194.) Having reviewed the Motion, Defendants’ Response (Dkt. No. 197), and all supporting materials, the Court DENIES the Motion.

“Parties may obtain discovery regarding any nonprivileged matter that is relevant to any party's claim or defense and proportional to the needs of the case. . . .” Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(1). In determining proportionality the Court considers “the importance of the issues at stake in the action, the amount in controversy, the parties’ relative access to relevant information, the parties’ resources, the importance of the discovery in resolving the issues, and whether the burden or

1 expense of the proposed discovery outweighs its likely benefit.” Id. And Local Civil Rule require
2 the parties to meet and confer prior to filing a motion to compel and to a file a certification that
3 they have done so. See Local Civil Rule 37(a)(1).

4 Although Williams sufficiently met and conferred prior to filing this Motion, the Court
5 finds that the information sought is not relevant and need not be produced. As Defendants
6 explain, the redacted portion of the email lists the names of other incarcerated individuals who
7 received the same email. Moreover, the email itself only describes the need to add sales tax to
8 orders from a music vendor. The email does not appear to contain relevant information and
9 Williams has failed to demonstrate that the redacted names of the recipients are relevant
10 information that must be produced. The Court therefore DENIES the Motion.

11 The clerk is ordered to provide copies of this order to Plaintiff and all counsel.

12 Dated October 4, 2023.

13 

14 Marsha J. Pechman
15 United States Senior District Judge
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24